Partial acceptability in Polish and English generative research

Keywords: acceptability judgments, partial acceptability, linguistic intuitions, linguistic gradience

This talk concerns the notion of partial acceptability (and its varying degrees) in the assessment of Polish and English linguistic constructions taken from the field of generative grammar. Generative research has often been criticized for, among other things, its heavy reliance on artificially constructed examples which, according to some, would never be uttered in spontaneous language production. One natural consequence of assuming this approach is the need for acceptability judgments, which are often informal and based entirely on linguistic intuitions of the people who make them (cf., *inter alia*, Chomsky 1965; Schütze 1996; Cowart 1997). This is a contentious issue which has been generating numerous discussions over the past several years (for an overview of the two opposing standpoints see Gibson and Fedorenko 2010 and Sprouse et al. 2013). Sprouse and Almeida (2012, 2017) and Sprouse et al. (2013) argue that despite their informal nature acceptability judgments yield data which has a high (~95%) replication rate in formal acceptability experiments. However, Linzen and Oseki (2018), drawing on their findings from Hebrew and Japanese, suggest that languages with smaller communities of active linguists are more likely to show lower replication rates for their acceptability judgments.

In this talk the issue raised by Linzen and Oseki (2018) will be addressed, albeit indirectly. Linzen and Oseki understandably assume that the least reliable acceptability judgments are those marked as partially acceptable, as exemplified below by the Polish data:

 (1) a. Maria wydawała się być miła / ?miłą. Mary seemed refl be nice_{NOM} / nice_{INSTR} 		(Witkoś et al. 2011)
'Mary seemed to be nice.'		
b. Maria chce być miła / ??miłą.		
Mary wants be nice _{NOM} / nice _{INSTR}		
'Mary wants to be nice.'		
(2) ??[Którego sąsiada]i jegoi żona	otruła?	(Wiland 2016)
which neighbor _{ACC} his wife _{NOM}	poisoned	
'Which neighbor _i did his _i wife poison?'	-	
(3) ?*W zeszłym roku, w którym Jan się urodził, było bardzo ciepło. (Citko 2016)		
in last year in which Jan refl was born was very warm		

'Last year, when Jan was born, was very warm.'

The central part of the talk will report on a meta-linguistic comparative analysis of partially acceptable judgments in a representative sample of generative papers centered on Polish and English, respectively, with the aim of fully understanding the role of partial acceptability for each of the two languages. The specific aspects of the comparison will include: 1) the extent of the use of partially acceptable judgments; 2) the use of gradient partial acceptability; 3) the function of partially acceptable judgments (e.g. Are slightly unacceptable examples, typically marked with '?', uniformly used as a source of positive evidence for a given point made by their authors?). The results of the analysis will reveal a number of differences between Polish and English generative research with respect to partial acceptability, which will (partly) explain Linzen and Oseki's predictions concerning lower replications rates for languages other than English. They will also prepare the ground for the planned empirical study of replication rates for Polish acceptability judgments.

Word count: 395

References:

Chomsky, Noam. 1965. Aspects of the theory of syntax. Cambridge: MIT Press.

Citko, Barbara. 2016. "Types of Appositive Relative Clauses in Polish", *Studies in Polish Linguistics* 11: 85-100.

Cowart, Wayne. 1997. Experimental syntax: Applying objective methods to sentence judgments. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Gibson, Ted and Evelina Fedorenko. 2010. "Weak quantitative standards in linguistics research", *Trends in Cognitive Sciences* 14: 233–234.

Linzen, Tal and Yohei Oseki. 2018. "The reliability of acceptability judgments across languages." Glossa: A Journal of General Linguistics 3(1): 1-25.

Schütze, Carson T. 1996. *The empirical base of linguistics: Grammaticality judgments and linguistic methodology*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

Sprouse, Jon and Diogo Almeida. 2012. "Assessing the reliability of textbook data in syntax: Adger's Core Syntax." Journal of Linguistics 48(3): 609–652.

Sprouse, Jon and Diogo Almeida. 2017. "Design sensitivity and statistical power in acceptability judgment experiments." Glossa: A Journal of General Linguistics 2(1): 1–32.

Sprouse, Jon, Carson T. Schütze and Diogo Almeida. 2013. "A comparison of informal and formal acceptability judgments using a random sample from *Linguistic Inquiry* 2001–2010", *Lingua* 134: 219-248.

Wiland, Bartosz. 2016. "Le Charme Discret of Remnant Movement: Crossing and Nesting in Polish OVS Sentences", *Studies in Polish Linguistics* 11: 133-165.

Witkoś, Jacek, Piotr Cegłowski, Anna Snarska and Sylwiusz Żychliński. 2011. *Wybrane aspekty derywacji i interpretacji wyrażeń bezokolicznikowych* [Selected aspects of the derivation and interpretation of infinitives]. Poznań: Adam Mickiewicz University Press.